

MEETING NOTES OF THE FIRST PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT SESSION FOR THE PROPOSED KING DAVID MOWBRAY GOLF COURSE REDEVELOPMENT, 26 FEBRUARY 2025

| | | |
|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------|
| VENUE: | Pinelands Town Hall and MS Teams | START TIME: 18:00 |
| MEETING DATE: | 26 February 2025 | FINISH TIME: 20:30 |
| MEETING ATTENDANCE REGISTER | See Appendix A | |

This meeting was the first public engagement session for the proposed redevelopment of the King David Mowbray Golf Course and surrounds. The meeting was chaired by Alderman Matthew Kempthorne and Councillor Riad Davids.

Having completed the information-gathering phase of the project, representatives of the City of Cape Town's appointed professional team, Mr Jeremy Rose (Infinity Environmental), and Ms Anine Trümpelmann (@Planning) presented the project background as well as key findings from the Status Quo phase.

A copy of the presentation is appended hereto.

As the meeting had hybrid online and in-person attendance, notes of the meeting are presented in two separate sections: the first details verbal (online and in-person) questions and answers (Q&A), and the second details the written Q&A.

Q&A SUMMARY (VERBAL QUESTIONS)

Query: **Ms Carey Ouwkerk** (online)

Questioned whether the proposed development has already been approved.

Response: **Alderman Matthew Kempthorne**

Responded that no decisions have been made yet and technical decisions will be made by council at a later stage.

Query: **Ms Nicole** (online)

Stated that the current sewage system is insufficient and queried how the capacity will be increased to accommodate the proposed development.

Comment: **Dr Mari Thiar** (online)

Asked if there will be a MyCiti bus route through Pinelands.

Response: **Ms Anine Trümpelmann**

Responded that the current issues are being noted although no answers exist yet regarding sewage or MyCiti routes. This information will be included in the next round of public

engagement. No MyCiti route for Pinelands has been proposed yet and transport options are still being investigated.

Response: **Councillor Riad Davids**

Responded that an upgrade of the Athlone WWTW is expected in the next 5 years, but prejudgments must not be made regarding what will occur on site and it is best to ask these questions later in the process.

Query: **Mr Rory Mills**, Pinelands resident and consultant (in person)

Sought clarification regarding the area of the site.

Response: **Ms Anine Trümpelmann**

Responded that the total study area of the site is 66ha.

Query: **Attendee** (in person)

Stated that approval for Portion B of the site has not been obtained and queried on what authority is the project being commenced and how the lack of approval will affect the process.

Response: **Ms Anine Trümpelmann**

Responded that council will not decide on disposal of the site at this stage, but is undertaking the necessary land use processes, i.e., feasibility and design investigations for the total study area so that designs can respond to opportunities and constraints over the entire study area.

Response: **Alderman Matthew Kempthorne**

Added that he will investigate this question further.

Query: **Clyde Pinelands Football Chairperson** (in person)

Expressed shock that the club has been included in this proposal as the club is a functional well-utilised sports ground.

Response: **Councillor Riad Davids**

Responded that there is no decision at this stage regarding what is to be retained or removed on the site, and these decisions will be informed by various specialists during the process. Concerns and inputs at this stage will be noted and feed into next steps.

Comment: **Cameron Gray** (online)

Questioned whether there is any feedback on how the assessments of possible sites were done, and what led to the decision to proceed with an investigation into this site over the others.

Response: **Alderman Matthew Kempthorne**

Responded that there are a number of state-owned sites under investigation. These are indicated in the Integrated Development Plan and include the subject site.

Comment: **Reclaim the City** (in person)

Stated the golf course site had been invaded in 2019 to draw attention to the plight of poor people in the City and expressed approval that the City is investigating the site. She requested that tertiary education be included in the proposals.

Query: Brendan Carroll, Pinelands resident and headmaster (in person)
Commented that Pinelands schools are oversubscribed. He queried whether discussions have been held with the WCED and what the plans are in this regard.

Response: Ms Anine Trümpelmann

Responded that the current investigation includes a needs assessment of education and community facilities. The Education Department will be engaged with to understand standards and requirements.

Response: Alderman Matthew Kempthorne

Acknowledged that lack of enough schools is a huge issue and will be considered as it is a city-wide issue.

Response: Councillor Riad Davids

Responded that the potential for a school will be included in the conceptual development phase.

Query: African Centre for Cities (in person)

Queried timelines and whether submissions could be made until June and July 2025, to allow for inputs from a study currently being undertaken by African Centre of Cities at the University of Cape Town of how the rivers are used.

Response: Mr Jeremy Rose

Responded that the first deadline for inputs is 31 March 2025, but inputs will be welcomed throughout the process and future commenting periods will be allowed for.

Comment: Ms Desray Britz, chairperson of the Pinelands Ratepayers Association (in person)
Sought clarity regarding what is being requested from the public now.

Response: Alderman Matthew Kempthorne

Responded that all inputs are welcome at this stage on how the site should be used along with information on constraints.

Query: Attendee (in person)

Commented that she understands the need for housing but the negative aspects of losing this green space are hard to swallow.

She emphasised that more schools and social facilities are needed.

Response: Alderman Matthew Kempthorne

Responded that he agrees and more schools are needed.

Query: Pinelands resident (in person)

Raised the issue of poor water pressure and bulk water supply.

Response: Alderman Matthew Kempthorne

The water supply will be considered in the process.

Comment: **Ndifuna Ukwazi representative** (in person)

Queried whether affordable housing will be considered in the concept design including RDP housing.

Response: **Alderman Matthew Kempthorne**

Responded land is of high value and single small-plot residential may not be an ideal use.

Comment: **Buhle Booii**, Ndifuna Ukwazi (in person)

Stated that green spaces should not be used as a reason not to permit development, and affordable housing development is necessary. He expressed support for the process and that affordable housing should be developed on the site.

Comment: **Sandy McGuffog**, Chair of Pinelands CID (in person)

Questioned whether the City is aware of existing investment in camera infrastructure in the Clyde Pinelands area and stated they would be upset if it was bulldozed.

Response: **Ms Anine Trümpelmann**

This will be considered, and as noted in the presentation there is a multi-year process with various approvals and decisions required before any construction would be considered.

Comment: **Attendee** (in person)

Questioned whether objections from the Pinelands community will actually influence the process. Additionally expressed concerns regarding safety and security.

Response: **Alderman Matthew Kempthorne**

Responded that all inputs are welcome and will be carefully considered.

Response: **Councillor Riad Davids**

Stated that safety and security will be important in the process and will be considered throughout.

Query: **Mr Paul Stoher** (online)

Highlighted the traffic flow issue and how Forest Drive cannot be widened. Additionally, he enquired whether the area would fall within the Pinelands Improvement District.

Response: **Alderman Matthew Kempthorne**

The site is not currently within the Community Improvement District, and its potential future inclusion would be subject to the usual requirements for a vote by property owners and approval by the CID.

Query: **Ms Tanya Golden**, Pinelands resident (in person)

Requested that alongside the slideshow to be put up on the website, that information on what informed the City's decision to investigate this site should also be shared.

Response: **Alderman Matthew Kempthorne**

Indicated that this would be addressed and noted that the IDP and Municipal Structure Act are relevant.

Response: **Ms Anine Trümpelmann**

Noted that there are a number of approvals required from various authorities including environmental authorisation from the provincial authority, in addition to the town planning process. No final decisions have been made other than to commence with public participation and engage with residents to shape the future development of the site.

Query: **Mike Flax**, Chairperson of the King David Mowbray Golf Course (in person)

Noted that they have been the tenant for 115 years. He suggested that the site is an essential part of Cape Town's social and economic fabric. Over 20 000 visitors' rounds are played per year, many by tourists. The club also hosts a number of social and outreach programmes. He suggested the site is irreplaceable.

Query: **Resident** (in person)

Sought clarity regarding whether the proposed development is considered part of Pinelands. Additionally requested a printout of the presentation and queried the target numbers for housing and development.

Response: **Alderman Matthew Kempthorne**

Responded confirming the site is in Pinelands, but not part of the Special Ratings Area served by the CID.

Response: **Ms Anine Trümpelmann**

Responded by noting that there are currently no targets for development, but that the next set of engagements will provide some indication of development potential.

Query: **Ronald Haiden** (in person)

Expressed concern regarding the cumulative impact of other developments with this one (e.g. Oude Moulen, Maitland and Ndabeni) on transport.

Response: **Alderman Matthew Kempthorne**

The cumulative impact of the development on transport will be considered.

Comment: **Resident** (in person)

Queried why it is not acceptable to develop the area, when people live in difficult conditions. She indicated the development should benefit poorer people and allow them to live closer to places of work.

Query: **Mr Phillip Rosenthal** (online)

Stated that this land is part of the Coast to Coast Greenway identified in a city report about twenty years ago. This is not appropriate land for housing development. He stated that the environmental significance needs to be considered.

Response: **Mr Jeremy Rose**

Acknowledged the comment and asked him to share any available information on the plans regarding the ecological connectivity of the site.

Query: **Attendee** (in person)

Queried whether the number of developments in the surrounding area (~5) is normal.

Response: Ms Anine Trümpelmann

Responded by noting that the team is seeking to understand the dynamic of different types of projects proposed - and at various stages and timelines - in the surrounding area.

Comment: Mr Mark Jobs, Pinelands resident (in person)

Noted that the site presents an opportunity for connectivity between historically separated communities and that the professional team should look at it from that perspective and should involve members of those communities.

Query: Mr Jack Thonissen, President of the Pinelands Hockey Club (in person)

Noted that he is pro-development and that the major needs in the area are for sports and schools. He enquired who will undertake the needs analysis for sports and schools, and whether there will be consultation with the Department of Sports and Recreation.

Response: Ms Anine Trümpelmann

Responded saying that the WCED and Recreation and Parks Department will be consulted.

Query: Ms Heidi Ebrahim, Pinelands resident (in person)

Queried the meaning of 'urban creep' and the timeframes of the leases in place with lessees.

Response: Alderman Matthew Kempthorne

Responded that he is unsure about the terms and conditions of the leases but there is a 2-year termination clause on the 10-year lease, which commenced in 2024.

Query: Mr Kevin Patel (in person)

Suggested the lease rates are low. He indicated that feedback is needed on the status of other sites and investigations in the area including the Athlone Power Station.

Response: Alderman Matthew Kempthorne

Responded that the Athlone Power Station site is being considered for energy uses, as it is not suitable for residential development for various reasons.

Response: Councillor Riad Davids

Responded that the Oude Molen development, despite the provincial basket of rights, falls within the City projects and feedback on the progress of other sites will be provided.

Query: Colin van der Walt, Pineland resident (in person)

Questioned the purpose of the meeting and what will be different about this compared with Conradie Park where objections were not heard.

Response: Councillor Riad Davids

Suggested the success of Conradie is indicated in its waiting lists and requested the speaker engage offline with him.

Query: Attendee, Pinelands resident (in person)

Queried why all access routes are indicated in and out of Pinelands and suggested there is potential for other options including bridges over the river, rail, and highways.

Query: **Attendee**, Pinelands resident (in person)

Queried whether one of the outcomes may be whether the golf course is still the best use or whether the assumption is that the site will be developed no matter what.

Response: **Alderman Matthew Kempthorne**

Emphasised that no decision has yet been made on the best use of the site. The specialist studies are critical to guiding these decisions.

Query: **David Booth** (in person)

Stated that he had submitted proposals for the site previously and requested acknowledgement.

Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)

All comments and submissions are acknowledged, and we confirm we have Mr Booth's proposals on file.

Q&A SUMMARY (WRITTEN QUESTIONS)

Query: **Lynn Shires**

Queried how fauna that use the ground for feeding and breeding will be handled.

Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)**

An assessment of fauna and habitat will form part of the environmental studies.

Query: **Martin De Waal**

Queried if the decision has been made to go ahead with the development and if Council is now conducting a consultative process. Also queried if a pre- and post-feasibility study on the Pinelands will be conducted in terms of property market values as well as traffic congestion and crime, etc.

Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)

Responded that no decisions have been made yet and decisions whether to proceed will be made by council at a later stage. A socio-economic and traffic impact assessment will be done that will consider various socio-economic and traffic impacts of the development. In terms of property market values, the Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act (2013) prohibits an authority from making land-use decisions based on the value of another property.

Query: **Saliem Haider**

Queried the purpose of the PPP process without the technical and feasibility studies, and if it is merely to inform stakeholders.

Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)

The current PPP process is to allow members of the public to register as Interested and Affected Parties (I&APs), and inform stakeholders about the proposed development and how they can participate in the process. No statutory public participation processes have commenced.

Query: **Paul Stohrer**

Questioned why the City needs to dispose of this land when there is so much other land to develop closer to schools and other amenities.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)*

Responded that there are a number of state-owned sites under investigation. These are indicated in the Spatial Development Frameworks, and include the subject site.

*Query: **Paul Stohrer***

Stated that the project should not be at this PPP phase if there is insufficient feasibility studies being done for all of the City's Service Delivery Capacity or Capabilities and Town and Urban Planning that addresses a cohesive society.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)*

Responded that these current services constraints are noted, and the team will address these in the civil services assessments to follow. The current PPP process is to allow members of the public to register as Interested and Affected Parties (I&APs), and inform stakeholders about the proposed development and how they can participate in the process. No statutory public participation processes have commenced.

*Query: **Carey Ouwerkerk***

Raised the concern that there may be limited space at existing schools and limited capacity of existing infrastructure in the Pinelands area. She objected to the development.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)*

Responded that the current investigation includes a needs assessment of education and community facilities. The Education Department will be engaged with to understand standards and requirements. Current services constraints are noted, and the team will address these in the civil services assessments to follow.

*Comment: **Jeff Knickelbein***

Stated that King David Golf Club was evicted from the airport site and that the same is being done at Mowbray. He stated that this seemed suspicious.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)***

Responded that as far as this team is aware the King David Club was located on private land, while this site is city-owned land.

*Query: **Jenny Traviss***

Asked if this redevelopment would be another eye-sore like Conradie Park.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)***

Responded that we have taken note of this concern.

*Comment: **Jeff Knickelbein***

Raised the concern that the City of Cape is the 7th most congested city in the world and that the development is going to make the congestion significantly worse. He also raised concerns about the availability of schools and medical facilities.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)*

Traffic concerns have been noted, and these will be addressed in the upcoming traffic impact assessments. The current investigation includes a needs assessment of education and community facilities.

*Query: **Paul Stohrer***

Asked if this area would form part of the Pinelands CID.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)***

If development were to proceed the new community would have to vote on its inclusion, as would the CID on whether this would be financially appropriate.

*Comment: **Saliem Haider***

Stated that there is a strong focus on Climate Change impacts, not only in the province but also nationally and internationally.

Additionally, he asked how this development would positively contribute to improved CC, mode of transport, quality of houses constructed, and beneficiation opportunities with sewage and waste, rather than add more burden on systems.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)*

This concern is noted, and efforts will be made in the design process to reduce climate change impacts where feasible. The capacity of services and transport routes will be investigated.

*Comment: **Jenny Traviss***

Asked if crime has been addressed as there is reportedly a huge problem on the Clyde Pinelands side of the site.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)*

Security will be addressed as part of the urban design for the site.

*Comment: **Carey Ouwerkerk***

Stated that she opposes the development.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)*

This has been noted.

*Comment: **Paul Stohrer***

Asked the team to advise on alternative traffic flows other than the existing Forest Drive and stated that the traffic studies are fruitless as the City has already acknowledged that Forrest Drive cannot be widened for the MyCiti.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)*

Consideration of transport and access linkages is included in the current investigation.

Comment: Nicole

Stated that the local schools, whether RCD, Primary or High are massively oversubscribed - e.g. PHS has 2500 applications for 200 spaces, and asked how children in this proposed development will be accommodated.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After the meeting)

Responded that the current investigation includes a needs assessment of education and community facilities. The Education Department will be engaged with to understand standards and requirements.

Comment: Jenny Traviss

Queried if there will there be a new entry into Pinelands from Jan Smuts or the N2 as this may increase the crime.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After the meeting)

Consideration of transport and access linkages is included in the current investigation. Security will be addressed in the urban design of the site.

Comment: Paul Stohrer

Commented that the Black River Canal is a mess and the City cannot maintain it. He asked if the same would happen to the Elsies Canal with the increased density and non-monitoring by the City.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After the meeting)

Given the presence of the Elsieskraal River on site, maintenance measures would be included in any future proposals to ensure the relevant section of the Elsieskraal River is managed in accordance with applicable legislation.

Comment: Dr. M Thiar

Asked the team to indicate the MiCiti bus route through Pinelands, as local connections are non-existent and stated that Clyde is essentially a cul-de-sac.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After the meeting)

Consideration of transport and access linkages is included in the current investigation.

Comment: Nicole

Commented on the current sewerage system. It was stated that Pinelands residents have been living with a smell that is so bad we can't go outdoors on some days. How is that capacity going to be increased to deal with the increased demand.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After the meeting)

Responded that these current sewerage constraints are noted, and the team will address these in the civil services assessments.

Comment: Nicole

Questioned why Rondebosch Golf Course was not selected, instead of KD.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After the meeting)
Responded that there are a number of state-owned sites under investigation. These are indicated in the Integrated Development Plan and include the subject site.

Comment: Megan Becker
Asked for the definition of 'affordable housing'.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After the meeting)
According to the [Department of Human Settlements \(DHS\)](#), "Affordable housing broadly constitutes the provision of rental and social housing programmes, and instruments to provide housing finance to traditionally unserved segments of the population."

Comment: Carey Ouwkerk
Expressed concern at the limited number of schools available in the area, and that existing schools are at capacity.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)
This question was raised in a verbal question.

The verbal question was responded to noting that the current investigation includes a needs assessment of education and community facilities. The Education Department will be engaged with to understand standards and requirements. The ward councillor noted that any development would need to include provision for adequate schools.

Comment: Paul Stohrer
Asked what is the postal code of this area as insurance premiums are linked to postal codes.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After the meeting)
Responded that the postal code for the site is 7450.

Comment: Paul Stohrer
Asked what the by-laws of this area are and if the By-Laws of Pinelands will apply to this area.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)
Responded that the site is outside the Pinelands Heritage Protection Overlay Zoning.

Query: Thiar, M, Dr
Questioned where all the water drain that almost flooded the canals last year, if the canal is decanalised.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)
These aspects would certainly be investigated in the stormwater management studies that form part of this team's brief.

Comment: Paul Stohrer

Queried what the City's plans on Crime and Grime are as the Conradie site is not a pretty site.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After the meeting)*

Security considerations will be addressed as part of the urban design for the site.

*Comment: **Cameron Gray***

Asked if there is any feedback on how the assessments of possible sites were done, and what led to the decision to proceed with an investigation into this site over the other sites.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)***

There are a number of state-owned sites under investigation. These are indicated in the Integrated Development Plan and include the subject site.

*Comment: **Paul Stohrer***

Questioned where the traffic studies are.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)***

Responded that transport and traffic engineering aspects are a key informant and specialist study.

*Comment: **Cameron Gray***

Queried which specialist study covers the currently constrained services such as sewerage.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)***

The Civil Engineering / Civil Services team will be investigating service availability including sewerage, water, electrical, and stormwater services.

*Query: **Patsy Daniels***

Asked about the size overall plot and what 30% affordable housing equate to and sent apologies if the question already asked.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)***

The developable area of the site is yet to be determined. Once a concept design is available, the area required for affordable housing can be determined.

*Query: **Scott Alexander (ZA)***

Asked the team to confirm that any development would adhere fully to all aspects of the Pinelands Garden City bylaws, specifically green spaces, trees, sidewalks, parks, occupancy, accessibility, and the maximum % of area that buildings can take.

*Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** (After meeting)*

It is assumed that this query refers to the Heritage Protection Overlay Zoning (HPOZ) for the Pinelands area. It is noted that the site is not located within the HPOZ. Should the development proceed, all relevant by-laws will be adhered to.

*Comment: **Carol Clark***

Stated that it was originally proposed as a Mowbray Golf Course development and questioned why the whole of Clyde Pinelands is now included, which includes floodplain.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) *(After the meeting)*

All maps and images shared of the proposed development area have included the Clyde Pinelands Football Club as forming part of the site under investigation.

Query: Yves Ducommon

Queried if there are any measures in place to prevent housing speculation with investors buying properties in order to rent out to nomads and/or AirBnB. It was strongly recommended that access be restricted to locals only buying for themselves.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)

Responded that the question will be noted for a future response when the project has reached a more detailed level of planning.

Query: Yves Ducommon

Asked on what grounds the selection was made on who would be allowed in the hall and who would be accessing the online meeting only.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)

Responded that in-person RSVPs were closed only when the venue capacity had been reached, and later RSVPs were directed to the online option.

Comment: Dr. M Thiar

Queried if there were any images/maps that could be shared.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) *(After meeting)*

Maps and images are included in the presentation from the first public meeting, and these are available on the project website. Maps can be provided on request from the project team.

Comment: Paul Stohrer

Stated that the population growth must be aligned to industrial area development. This project growth is out of context. He added that the growth areas of the City is along the R300 corridor. There is very little industrial growth planned for this area of Cape Town. The people will need to travel towards Bellville for their workplaces. The Spatial Objectives is again skewed. Pinelands is furthest away from Philippi and Bellville. The Wynberg spatial development is much smaller the Philippi and Bellville developments.

It was stated that the City is developing The Philippi Opportunity Area and the Bellville / R300 corridors, yet they want to politically appease National Government that they are being inclusive. Yet this is more divisive.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) *(After meeting)*

This site was identified in the Spatial Development Framework for this purpose, and subject to previous public participation in this and previous spatial framework plans.

Comment: Paul Stohrer

Asked why the City needs to dispose of this land when there is so much other land to develop closer to schools and other amenities. He stated that the City is disposing of land because it is easier to do this instead of acquiring land in more appropriate places closer to future industrial and commercial developments.

Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** *(After meeting)*

There are a number of state-owned sites under investigation. These are indicated in the Spatial Development Framework and include the subject site.

Comment: **Paul Stohrer**

Stated that the statement of all services being taken into consideration between the three spheres of government is incorrect. He added that these spheres of government have their own budgeting cycles and priorities and they never align in reality. It was stated that there are numerous examples of this around Cape Town.

Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** *(After meeting)*

Responded that bulk services will be assessed.

Comment: **Dr M Thiar**

Stated that they want independent assessors regarding this. It was stated that they are asking questions but they are getting emotional about this.

Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** *(After meeting)*

Responded that the appointed professional team are independent consultants.

Comment: **Dr M Thiar**

Stated that there must be something to say about "historical sites" despite it not being heritage area.

Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** *(After meeting)*

It is assumed that this query refers to the Heritage Protection Overlay Zoning (HPOZ) for the Pinelands area. It is noted that the site is not located within the HPOZ. Should the development proceed, all relevant by-laws will be adhered to.

Comment: **Dr M Thiar**

Stated that both the footballers and the golfers (who will lose their space) have been dismissed.

Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** *(After meeting)*

Responded that the Clyde Pinelands Football Club and Kind David Mowbray Golf Club are being kept informed and will continue to be consulted on the proposed redevelopment. Developable areas within the site have not yet been identified.

Comment: **Jean Marc Ithier**

Asked what was going to happen to the soccer fields.

Response: **Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity)** *(After meeting)*

Responded that the project is in the vision and concept design phase of the proposed redevelopment. Developable areas have not yet been identified.

Comment: Wouter Schreuders

Stated that neighbourhoods are not poor simply because of a lack of wealth; but rather, criminal behaviour within the community plays a significant role in keeping them that way. It was stated that when residents repeatedly exploit and take from their own neighbourhood, it discourages any external investment, trapping the area in a cycle of poverty.

It was further stated that the idea that poverty can be solved by relocating people to a different neighbourhood ignores the root issue. If the same behaviours persist, the result is not integration or improvement but rather the formation of new problem areas, ultimately putting others at risk.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After meeting)

Responded that the socio-economic impact assessment will address these concerns.

Query: Martin De Waal

Asked if this was going to be Low-Cost Housing, and that if yes, then he was sure that the residents of Pinelands would not be too happy.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After meeting)

This proposed development is a mixed-use development that will include a portion of affordable housing.

Comment: Yazied Davids

Stated that there is only one SAPS vehicle that services Pinelands, Thornton, Epping and Ndabeni. Added that it did not change after the Conradie Development and it will not change if this development goes ahead. It was stated that the City has no control over SAPS and that they won't have the necessary resources.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After meeting)

Security will be addressed as part of the urban design for the site.

Query: Dean Ward

Asked if the period for inputs can be extended, as this is a short period of time to expect inputs.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After meeting)

Responded that there will be additional opportunities for Interested and Affected Parties to comment on the proposed redevelopment.

Comment: Philip Rosenthal

Stated that this land is part of the Coast to Coast Greenway identified in a city report about twenty years ago. This is not appropriate land for housing development. Micro studies are unnecessary if this site is not appropriate.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After meeting)

Responded that the site has long been designated in the Spatial Development Framework for investigation to redevelop.

Comment: Lindsay Pietersen

Asked if consideration should be given on how this will affect property values in Pinelands and if property value growth rate slow down.

Response: Mowbray Stakeholder Team (Infinity) (After meeting)

Responded that the Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act (2013) prohibits an authority from making land-use decisions based on the value of another property. To plan inclusionary housing exclusively in areas with low property values would be simply to perpetuate the existing unsustainable norm, in which people with lower incomes live in places furthest removed from economic activity.

Appendix A

| Name | Attendance |
|-----------------------|------------|
| Adriaan Rootman | In person |
| Aluncedo Booï | In person |
| Batandwa Ntsebeza | In person |
| Brendan Carroll | In person |
| Buhle Booï | In person |
| Charles Gosling | In person |
| Cindy-Lee Hangone | In person |
| Colette Chamberlain | In person |
| Corne Pelser | In person |
| Dan Nesper | In person |
| Aasif Khan | Online |
| Abigail Hinchcliffe | Online |
| Adele Joynt | Online |
| Adelle Johnson | Online |
| Adrian Roberts | Online |
| Akhona Siswana | Online |
| Alan Shepard | In person |
| Alison Dixon | In person |
| Andoliswa Molesi | In person |
| Andre Tromp | Online |
| Andrew Brotchie | Online |
| Andrew Walton | Online |
| Andy wright | Online |
| Anna-Lise Williamson | Online |
| Antonie Christie | Online |
| Aphiew Ngalo | In person |
| Archie Arendse | Online |
| Arun Thomas | Online |
| Asheeqah L | In person |
| Ashuria Easton | In person |
| Aurther Mills | In person |
| Axolile Notywala | Online |
| Ayabulela Gwehzame | In person |
| Barry Clarke | Online |
| BG Sudano | Online |
| Bob Butchart | Online |
| Bradley Bonner | Online |
| Brenda Adams | In person |
| Brett Carnegie | In person |
| Brian Bernhardt | Online |
| Brian Shepherd | In person |
| Busiswa Arosi | Online |
| C. Van Der Walt | In person |
| Cameron Gray | Online |
| Captain Carinsky | In person |
| carey ouwerkerk | Online |
| Carl Roberts | Online |
| Carol Clark | Online |
| Catherine Gay | Online |
| Chamarya Jonnacagadda | In person |

| Name | Attendance |
|-------------------------------|------------|
| Charles Page | Online |
| Charmaine Titus | In person |
| Cheth Mangoli | In person |
| Chloe Swartz | In person |
| Chris Owen | Online |
| Christopher Vadoros | Online |
| Chrystal Vink | Online |
| Cindy sims | Online |
| Clyde Pinelands Football Club | In person |
| Colette Chamberlain | In person |
| D. Kimp | In person |
| Dale Hillebrand | Online |
| Daniel Hangone | In person |
| Daphne Sole | In person |
| David Booth | In person |
| Mrs Booth | In Person |
| Dean Stephen WARD | Online |
| Deneys van Reenen | In person |
| Derek Davis | Online |
| Desray J Britz | In person |
| Diana McGrath | In person |
| Dot Jack | In person |
| Douglas Bruce-Brand | Online |
| Dumevico Davids | In person |
| Elizabeth Idas | In person |
| Elsie Malinaric | Online |
| Emily Bolton | In person |
| Emily Bolton | Online |
| Eric McLwan | In person |
| Etienne Grobler | Online |
| evalina van wijk | Online |
| Fahldie Damon | Online |
| Faried Ebrahim | In person |
| Felicity Adams | In person |
| Fouzia Orrie | Online |
| G. Makhaei | In person |
| Gabs Pather | In person |
| Gavin Wiseman | In person |
| genine josias | Online |
| Georgie Ravenscroft | In person |
| Gerald Croxford | In person |
| GILLIAN FORD | Online |
| Gladys Mpofane | In person |
| Goolam Badroodien | In person |
| Grace Shani | In person |
| Graham Bentz | In person |
| Graham Chilcott | In person |
| Graham Clark | Online |
| Graham Noonan | Online |
| Graham Rundle | Online |
| grant holton | Online |
| Greg Sinden | Online |

| Name | Attendance |
|----------------------|------------|
| Heidi Ebrahim | In person |
| Hein Van Wyk | Online |
| Hennie du Plooy | In person |
| Hermann Schlenk | Online |
| Hilary Peinke | In person |
| Ian Dinan | Online |
| Ilham Gabien | In person |
| Ina Mafanya | In person |
| Ismail Matthews | In person |
| Jacinta Tarantello | Online |
| Jack Derman | In person |
| Jack Thonissen | In person |
| James Rich | Online |
| Jamy Fredericks | Online |
| Jane Frans | In person |
| Janette Wright | Online |
| Janice Cocks | In person |
| Jasmiena Links | In person |
| Jason Reid | Online |
| Jean Marc Ithier | Online |
| Jean Moutmey | In person |
| Jean Sleigh | Online |
| Jeffrey Knickelbein | Online |
| Jenny Traviss | Online |
| Jessica White | In person |
| Joan Wright | Online |
| Johan Meyer | Online |
| John Birkett | Online |
| John Boniaszczuk | In person |
| John Gibberd | Online |
| Jonathan Hemp | Online |
| Jonathan Miller | Online |
| JP van Wyk | Online |
| Julia van Reenen | In person |
| K. Ailayr | In person |
| Kamo Mculu | Online |
| Kamogelo Shika | Online |
| KAREN MINNIE | Online |
| Karien Slabbert | In person |
| Kashiefa Achmat | In person |
| Katherine-Anne James | Online |
| Kathie Troost | Online |
| Keith Minnaar | In person |
| Keith Tacon | In person |
| Kevin Lacey | Online |
| Kevin patel | In person |
| Kevin Stephens | Online |
| Kwanele Mhlambo | In person |
| L. Sryil | In person |
| L. tiye | In person |
| Latifah Jacobs | Online |
| Laurie Gardener | Online |

| Name | Attendance |
|-----------------------|------------|
| Leesha Singh | Online |
| Leon Myburgh | Online |
| Lily Reich | Online |
| Linda Dewy | In person |
| Lindsay Pietersen | Online |
| Lindy Lawler | Online |
| Liz Bax | Online |
| Lizahn Bowers | Online |
| Lizl Davel | Online |
| Loftus Marais | In person |
| Lorenzo Johnson | In person |
| LT Koopman | In person |
| Lynn Shires | Online |
| M. Sehenam | In person |
| Manu Jordan | In person |
| Marguerite Wiseman | In person |
| Mari Thiart | Online |
| Maria Modabuka | In person |
| Mark Job | In person |
| Mark Wilkin | In person |
| Martin De Waal | Online |
| Maryrose Van Rensburg | Online |
| Matthew Coon | Online |
| Matthew Draper | Online |
| Matthew I | In person |
| Maurice de Waal | Online |
| Megan Becker | Online |
| Meghane | In person |
| Merrewyn Betteridge | Online |
| Merrick Brown | In person |
| Michael Devoti | In person |
| Michael Dixon | Online |
| Michael Manson-Kullin | Online |
| Michael Van Rensburg | Online |
| Michelle Alrick | Online |
| Michelle Martin | Online |
| Mike Flax | In person |
| Morven Karsten | Online |
| Mrs S Pitcher | Online |
| Msimelelo Mdledle | Online |
| Muraad Diedericks | Online |
| Muz Omar | In person |
| Mystaqeem Moses | In person |
| Mzolisi Nanbara | In person |
| Naeema Yaseen | In person |
| Nandipha Ketelo | Online |
| Nathan Fisher | Online |
| Nazlie Sait | In person |
| Nezaam Harris | In person |
| Nicole Masureik | Online |
| Nikki Hendricks | Online |
| Nobukhosi Ngwenya | In person |

| Name | Attendance |
|------------------------|------------|
| Noel de Villiers | Online |
| Noer Johnstone | In person |
| Nombulelo Mary Sijiyi | Online |
| Nomthoanazo Nokebeka | In person |
| Ntsikie Dause | In person |
| Ntura Piwana | In person |
| Oliver Carson | Online |
| Pam Ludlam | In person |
| pamela may | Online |
| Pamela Silwana | Online |
| Patsy Daniels | Online |
| Paul Blows | Online |
| Paul Robertson | Online |
| Paul Stohrer | Online |
| Philip E Rosenthal | Online |
| Phillip Hans | Online |
| Pokoline Dyonese | In person |
| querida saal | Online |
| R. Abrahams | In person |
| Ra-eesa Shepherd | Online |
| Raj Moodaley | In person |
| Rameez Abbas | Online |
| Regan Kayser | Online |
| Riaan Marais | Online |
| Richard Francis | In person |
| Richard Fuggle | In person |
| Richard L. | In person |
| Rob Wilson | Online |
| Robby Robertson | Online |
| Robert Edwards | In person |
| Robert Kalamdien | In person |
| Rochelle Carelse | Online |
| Rodney Kleinsmith | In person |
| Ronald Haiden | In person |
| Rory Murray | Online |
| Rose Harris | Online |
| Roxanne Timm | Online |
| Russel Sampson | Online |
| Saliem Haider | Online |
| sam troost | Online |
| Samantha Keen | In person |
| Sandy McGuffog | In person |
| scott alexander | Online |
| Sean Van zyl | Online |
| Sellecaa Lang-petersen | In person |
| Shabnem Parker | Online |
| Shakeerah Diedericks | Online |
| Shandre Erasmus | In person |
| Sharon Gosling | In person |
| Shaun Jeffries | Online |
| Shely Moretlwe | In person |
| Sherfoodien Parker | In person |

| Name | Attendance |
|-----------------------------|------------|
| Siphokazi Madikane | In person |
| Stuart Henderson | Online |
| Sue Tacon | In person |
| Susan Alston | Online |
| Susanne van Niekerk | Online |
| Tamarin Simpson | Online |
| Tandeka Fako | In person |
| Tanya Golden | In person |
| Taryn Slabbert | In person |
| Tessa Shepherd | In person |
| Tina Moses | Online |
| Toto Ntsohi | Online |
| Trevor Steensma | In person |
| United housing Developments | In person |
| Vicki Emslie | In person |
| Vira Jagarnath | In person |
| Wahed Khan | In person |
| Wahed Khan | In person |
| Wooraan Dreyer | In person |
| Wouter Schreuders | Online |
| Yazied Davids | Online |
| Yusrah Bardien | In person |
| Yusrah Events | In person |
| Yves Ducommun | Online |
| Zaheer Parker | Online |
| Zandile Zuma | Online |
| Zizipho Mbunjana | Online |
| Zola Mbulawa | Online |